

[Submitting Counsel on Signature Page]

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

IN RE: JUUL LABS, INC., MARKETING,  
SALES PRACTICES, AND PRODUCTS  
LIABILITY LITIGATION

Case No. 19-md-02913-WHO

**JOINT CASE MANAGEMENT  
CONFERENCE STATEMENT AND  
PROPOSED AGENDA**

This Document Relates to:

ALL ACTIONS

Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 16-10(d) and the Court's February 19, 2021 Minute Order (ECF No. 1441), counsel for Defendants Juul Labs, Inc. ("JLI"), Altria,<sup>1</sup> Director Defendants,<sup>2</sup> E-Liquid Defendants,<sup>3</sup> Retailer Defendants,<sup>4</sup> and Distributor Defendants<sup>5</sup> (collectively "Defendants"), and Plaintiffs' Co-Lead Counsel ("Plaintiffs") (collectively referred to herein as

<sup>1</sup> "Altria" refers to Altria Group, Inc., and the Altria-affiliated entities named in Plaintiffs' Consolidated Class Action Complaint and Consolidated Master Complaint (collectively, "Complaints"), *see* ECF Nos. 387, 388.

<sup>2</sup> "Director Defendants" refers to Messrs. James Monsees, Adam Bowen, Nicholas Pritzker, Hoyoung Huh, and Riaz Valani.

<sup>3</sup> "E-Liquid Defendants" refers to Mother Murphy's Labs, Inc., Alternative Ingredients, Inc., Tobacco Technology, Inc., and Eliquitech, Inc.

<sup>4</sup> "Retailer Defendants" refers to Chevron Corporation, Circle K Stores, Inc., Speedway LLC, 7-Eleven, Inc., Walmart, and Walgreen Co.

<sup>5</sup> "Distributor Defendants" refers to McLane Company, Inc., Eby-Brown Company, LLC, and Core-Mark Holding Company, Inc.

46336263.1

1 the "Parties") respectfully provide this Joint Case Management Statement in advance of the  
 2 Further Case Management Conference scheduled for March 26, 2021.

3 **I. PARTICIPANT INFORMATION**

4 The conference will proceed via Zoom, and the Parties will not appear in person. Anyone  
 5 who wishes to attend the conference must log in using the information available at:  
 6 <https://www.cand.uscourts.gov/judges/orrick-william-h-who/>.

7 **II. ISSUES TO BE DISCUSSED BELOW AND PROPOSED AGENDA**

- 8     1. Status of Case Filings and Dismissals  
 9     2. Case Management Matters  
 10    3. Discovery Status  
 11    4. ADR Status

12 **III. STATUS OF CASE FILINGS AND DISMISSALS**

13       As of March 24, 2021, approximately 1,890<sup>6</sup> cases are pending in this MDL, naming 107  
 14 defendants. A list of these defendants is attached as **Exhibit A**. To date, 1,716 personal injury  
 15 cases and 170 government entity cases (including 130 school districts, 18 counties, 2 cities, and  
 16 19 tribes) have been filed in this MDL. 363 MDL plaintiffs have voluntarily dismissed their  
 17 cases (including 350 personal injury plaintiffs and 5 class plaintiffs and 3 school districts); 131  
 18 cases have been dismissed without prejudice pursuant to CMO No. 8; and 33 other cases are  
 19 subject to pending motions to dismiss without prejudice that have not yet been ruled upon.  
 20 Furthermore, 96 case dismissals without prejudice have been converted to dismissals with  
 21 prejudice pursuant to CMO No. 8.

22       There are 417 complaints pending in JCCP 5052, which is assigned to Judge Ann I. Jones  
 23 of the Los Angeles Superior Court as the Coordination Trial Judge. There are 77 government  
 24 entity cases, including 73 school districts and 338 personal injury cases brought on behalf of over  
 25 2,464 individual personal injury plaintiffs. There are 23 defendants named in those JCCP cases.

26  
 27       

---

<sup>6</sup> The numbers in this Statement reflect the Parties' good faith estimates based on reasonably  
 28 available information. The Parties will continue to work together to align their data and resolve  
 any inconsistencies.

1           The Parties are also aware of 15 cases filed by State Attorneys General specifically:  
2 California, Illinois, Hawai‘i, New York, North Carolina, Mississippi, Minnesota, Washington  
3 D.C., Arizona, Pennsylvania, New Mexico, Massachusetts, Colorado, Alaska and Washington.  
4 Plaintiffs’ Liaison Counsel continue their outreach to various State Attorneys General to discuss  
5 cooperation with this MDL.

6           An update on matters of significance (including hearings, schedules, deadlines,  
7 depositions, substantive orders, and trial dates) in Related Actions as defined by the Joint  
8 Coordination Order (CMO 9, ECF No. 572 at 1, 3), is attached hereto as **Exhibit B**.

9           **IV. CASE MANAGEMENT MATTERS**

10           **A. Proposed Amended CMO 10-A**

11           The parties have reached agreement on a proposed amendment to CMO 10-A to address  
12 the timing of production deposition transcripts from related cases. The proposed order is attached  
13 as **Exhibit C**.

14           **B. Personal Injury Actions**

15           Subject to the Court’s approval, the parties agree to a modest extension to the deadline for  
16 Plaintiffs to respond to the deferred pleading challenges, from April 13 to May 4, to ensure  
17 sufficient time to address the myriad state law issues raised across multiple briefs exceeding 150  
18 pages, as well as a similar and reasonable extension of time for Defendants to submit their reply.

19           **C. Appointment of a Deposition Special Master**

20           The parties have agreed in principle to seek appointment of a special master to resolve  
21 disputes that arise during depositions and have been meeting and conferring over potential  
22 candidates and the scope of the appointment. The parties will provide joint or competing  
23 proposed Orders by March 31. If the parties have not reached an agreement on the special master  
24 candidate proposal by that time, the parties will also propose a selection procedure for the Court’s  
25 consideration. The parties welcome any suggestions the Court may have regarding prospective  
26 candidates.

1                   **D.        Class Actions**

2                   As addressed in the parties' pending motion to dismiss briefing and in light of  
 3 Defendants' position concerning this Court's subject matter jurisdiction over certain class claims  
 4 (ECF Nos. 1397, 1481, 1557), Plaintiffs have prepared individual, underlying complaints on  
 5 behalf of fifty-seven named plaintiffs in the Second Amended Consolidated Class Action  
 6 Complaint. Given the \$402.00 fee for opening civic cases (via direct filing in the MDL), Plaintiffs  
 7 would incur more than \$22,000 in costs to effectuate the filing of the underlying complaints.  
 8 Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court waive the filing fees for the underlying complaints,  
 9 and are prepared to submit a proposed order if appropriate. Alternatively, for class representatives  
 10 who have also filed individual personal injury cases, Plaintiffs believe it would significantly  
 11 reduce costs for the underlying complaints to be filed in the class representatives' individual  
 12 personal injury dockets (rather than the primary MDL docket).

13                  Defendants note that personal injury plaintiffs have paid the filing fees and are unsure  
 14 why the class representatives should be different in this respect. However, Defendants believe  
 15 this is an issue between Plaintiffs and the Court. Defendants do not take a position with respect to  
 16 Plaintiffs' request and defer to the Court on this issue.

17                  **V.        DISCOVERY STATUS**

18                  On March 23, 2021, the Parties participated in a discovery conference with Judge Corley.  
 19 A copy of the March 22, 2021 Joint Discovery Status Report provided in advance of that  
 20 conference is attached as **Exhibit D**. The parties will be prepared to update the Court regarding  
 21 developments since that conference.

22                  The MDL Plaintiffs are holding weekly calls with JCCP counsel regarding discovery  
 23 coordination. Defendants appreciate and encourage coordination between the MDL and the  
 24 JCCP, as detailed by the Joint Coordination Order (CMO No. 9, ECF No. 572) and the  
 25 Deposition Protocol (CMO No. 10, ECF No. 573).

26                  **VI.      ADR STATUS**

27                  Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 16-10(d), the Parties report that they continue to confer with  
 28 Settlement Master Thomas J. Perrelli and cooperate with his recommendations.

1  
2 Dated: March 24, 2021  
3  
4

Respectfully submitted,

5 By: /s/ Renee D. Smith  
6  
7

Renee D. Smith (*pro hac vice*)  
James F. Hurst (*pro hac vice*)  
**KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP**  
300 N. LaSalle  
Chicago, IL 60654  
Telephone: (312) 862-2310

8  
9 By: /s/ Peter A. Farrell  
10  
11

Peter A. Farrell (*pro hac vice*)  
**KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP**  
1301 Pennsylvania Ave, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Telephone: (202) 389-5959

12  
13 By: /s/ Gregory P. Stone  
14  
15

Gregory P Stone, SBN 78329  
Bethany W. Kristovich, SBN 241891  
**MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP**  
350 South Grand Avenue  
Fiftieth Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90071-3426  
Telephone: (213) 683-9100

16  
17  
18  
19 Attorneys for Defendant Juul Labs, Inc.

By: /s/ Sarah R. London  
10  
11

Sarah R. London  
**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &**  
**BERNSTEIN**  
275 Battery Street, Fl. 29  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 956-1000

12  
13 By: /s/ Dena C. Sharp  
14  
15

Dena C. Sharp  
**GIRARD SHARP LLP**  
601 California St., Suite 1400  
San Francisco, CA 94108  
Telephone: (415) 981-4800

16  
17 By: /s/ Dean Kawamoto  
18  
19

Dean Kawamoto  
**KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.**  
1201 Third Ave., Ste. 3200  
Seattle, WA 98101  
Telephone: (206) 623-1900

20  
21 By: /s/ Ellen Relkin  
22  
23

Ellen Relkin  
**WEITZ & LUXENBERG**  
700 Broadway  
New York, NY 10003  
Telephone: (212) 558-5500

24  
25  
26  
27 Co-Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs

By: /s/ *John C. Massaro*

**ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER  
LLP**

John C. Massaro (admitted pro hac vice)  
Jason A. Ross (admitted pro hac vice)  
601 Massachusetts Ave., N.W.  
Washington D.C. 20001  
Telephone: (202) 942-5000  
Facsimile: (202) 942-5999  
[john.massaro@arnoldporter.com](mailto:john.massaro@arnoldporter.com)  
[Jason.ross@arnoldporter.com](mailto:Jason.ross@arnoldporter.com)

*Attorneys for Defendants Altria Group, Inc.  
and Philip Morris USA Inc.*

By: /s/ *Eugene Illovsy*

BOERSCH & ILLOVSKY LLP

Eugene Illovsky  
Martha Boersch  
Matthew Dirkes  
1611 Telegraph Ave., Suite 806  
Oakland, CA 94612  
Telephone: (415) 500-6643  
[eugene@boersch-illovsky.com](mailto:eugene@boersch-illovsky.com)  
[martha@boersch-illovsky.com](mailto:martha@boersch-illovsky.com)  
[matt@boersch-illovsky.com](mailto:matt@boersch-illovsky.com)

*Attorneys for Defendant Adam Bowen*

By: /s/ James Kramer

# **ORRICK HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE LLP**

James Kramer  
Roland Chang  
The Orrick Building  
405 Howard Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105-2669  
Telephone: (415) 773-5700  
[jkramer@orrick.com](mailto:jkramer@orrick.com)  
[rdchang@orrick.com](mailto:rdchang@orrick.com)

*Attorneys for Defendant James Monsees*

By: /s/ Michael J. Guzman

# KELLOGG, HANSEN, TODD, FIGEL & FREDERICK, P.L.L.C.

Mark C. Hansen  
Michael J. Guzman  
David L. Schwartz  
Sumner Square, 1615 M St., N.W., Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: (202) 326-7910  
[mguzman@kellogghansen.com](mailto:mguzman@kellogghansen.com)

*Attorneys for Defendants Nicholas Pritzker,  
Riaz Valani, and Hoyoung Huh*

1 By: /s/ Mitchell B. Malachowski

2 **TYSON & MENDES, LLP**

3 James E. Sell  
4 Mitchell B. Malachowski  
Stephen Budica  
April M. Cristal  
5 523 4th Street, Suite 100  
San Rafael, CA 94901  
6 Telephone: (628) 253-5070  
jsell@tysonmendes.com  
mmalachowski@tysonmendes.com  
sbudica@tysonmendes.com  
8 acristal@tysonmendes.com

9 *Attorneys for Defendants Mother Murphy's  
Labs, Inc., and Alternative Ingredients, Inc.*

11 By: /s/ Michael L. O'Donnell

12 **WHEELER TRIGG O'DONNELL LLP**

13 Michael L. O'Donnell  
James E. Hooper  
14 Marissa Ronk  
370 17th Street, Ste. 4500  
Denver, CO 80202  
16 Telephone: (303) 244-1850  
Odonnell@wtotrial.com  
hooper@wtotrial.com  
17 Ronk@wtotrial.com

18 *Attorneys for Defendant McLane Company,  
Inc.*

21 By: /s/ David R. Singh

22 **WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP**

23 David R. Singh  
Bambo Obaro  
24 201 Redwood Shores Parkway, 6th Floor  
Redwood Shores, CA 94065  
Telephone: (650) 802-3083  
david.singh@weil.com  
bambo.obaro@weil.com

25 *Attorneys for Defendant Core-Mark Holding  
Company, Inc.*

By: /s/ Robert Scher

**FOLEY & LARDNER LLP**

Robert Scher  
Peter N. Wang  
Graham D. Welch  
Dyana K. Mardon  
90 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10016-1314  
Telephone: (212) 682-7474  
Facsimile: (212) 687-2329  
rscher@foley.com  
pwang@foley.com  
gwelch@foley.com  
dmardon@foley.com

*Attorney for Defendants Tobacco  
Technology, Inc., and Eliquitech, Inc.*

By: /s/ Christopher J. Esbrook

**ESBROOK LAW P.C.**

Christopher J. Esbrook  
David F. Pustilnik  
Michael S. Kozlowski  
77 W. Wacker, Suite 4500  
Chicago, IL 60601  
Telephone: (312) 319-7681  
christopher.esbrook@esbrooklaw.com  
david.pustilnik@esbrooklaw.com  
michael.kozlowski@esbrooklaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Eby-Brown  
Company, LLC, Circle K Stores, and 7-  
Eleven, Inc., Speedway, and Walgreen Co.*

1 By: /s/ Donald F. Zimmer, Jr.

2 **KING & SPALDING LLP**

3 Donald F. Zimmer, Jr.  
4 Quyen L. Ta  
5 Jennifer T. Stewart  
6 101 Second Street, Suite 1000  
7 San Francisco, CA 94105  
Telephone: (415) 318-1200  
fzimmer@kslaw.com  
qta@kslaw.com  
jstewart@kslaw.com

8 *Attorneys for Defendant Walmart Inc.*

9 By: /s/ Charles C. Correll Jr.

10 **KING & SPALDING LLP**

11 Andrew T. Bayman (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
12 1180 Peachtree Street, Suite 1600  
Atlanta, GA 30309  
13 Telephone: (404) 572-4600  
abayman@kslaw.com

14 and

15 Charles C. Correll, Jr.  
16 Matthew J. Blaschke  
Alessandra M. Givens  
17 101 Second Street, Suite 2300  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Telephone: (415) 318-1200  
ccorrell@kslaw.com  
mblaschke@kslaw.com  
agivens@kslaw.com

18 *Attorneys for Defendant Chevron Corporation*

2142274.2